Discussion Scoring Rubric

PHY 310 -- *Readings for Teaching High School Physics*
Illinois State University Physics Department
Physics Teacher Education Program
Carl J. Wenning, Program Coordinator
Spring 2006

Discussion Leader: _____ Peer Evaluator: _____

Criterion / Assessment	Good (3 pts)	Fair (2 pts)	Poor/Unacceptable (1-0 pts)	Score
Goal Statement	Leader gives a clear, concise statement of discussion goal at start of discussion IF appropriate.	Leader gives statement of discussion goal at outset, but is unclear; students express some degree of confusion.	Leader gives inadequate or fails to give any statement of discussion goal at outset, or gives later in d	
Initiation of Discussion	Leader begins with a short, concise statement of the problem being discussed; avoids an introductory lecture.	Leader begins with rambling problem statement; has a tendency to lecture at the outset.	Leader begins discussion with a long lecture, and to some extents tends to solve the problem for students by self.	
Student Participation	Leader calls on males and females, gifted and challenged with equity; verbally encourages all to participate; uses appropriate wait time suitable for engagement of all students; maintains appropriate control over group behavior.	Leader tends to show some degree of bias; tends to call on one or two students in exclusion of others; makes limited effort to engage all students equally; poor application of wait time suitable for engagement of all students.	Leader clearly biased toward one class of students; does not make effort to engage all students equally; looses control over group behavior.	
Student Contributions	Leader serves primarily as a facilitator of discussion among students; provides minimum direction as needed.	Leader sometimes facilitates discussion among students; sometime lectures to an unreasonable extent.	Leader dominates discussion; more akin to a lecture than a discussion.	
Questioning Skills:				
-- Wait Time	Leader always uses adequate and appropriate wait time to encourage at least one student to respond.	Leader sometimes uses adequate and appropriate wait time to encourage at least one student to respond.	Leader does not employ wait time or does not do so effectively; tends to answer own questions.	
-- Responding to Students	Leader responds well to students who provide input; acknowledges and thanks with sincerity.	Leader only periodically or non-uniformly acknowledges contributions provided by students, or uses only such statements as okay, yes, etc.	Leader fails to acknowledge in any reasonable and consistent way contributions made by students.	
-- Question Types	Leader uses a wide variety of question types; uses questions that directly bear on the expressed goal; avoids rhetorical questions; manages to have students think and talk critically about topic.	Leader uses a limited variety of question types; limited applicability of questions to goal attainment; some use of rhetorical questions.	Leader uses a very limited variety of question types; some showing a degree of inapplicability to goal attainment; does not achieve any reasonable depth of discussion.	
-- Question Number	Leader restricts discussion to 5 or 6 key questions that appropriately frame the subject matter under discussion and focus on comprehensive understanding; makes limited use of follow-up questions.	Leader uses a mix of key and minor questions, but key questions are not adequately addressed; too much emphasis on minor details of discussion subject; student comprehension limited.	Leader has no key questions; uses a multitude of minor questions that do not readily frame the scope of the discussion; questions too narrow to allow comprehensive understanding.	

-- Question Shifting	Leader generally begins discussion with divergent questions and moves toward convergent questions near the end of the discussion; makes appropriate digressions if necessary.	Leader's choice of questions somewhat erratic, but tend to move from divergent to convergent as discussion continues.	Leader does not exhibit any concern for type of questions asked either at beginning or conclusion.	
-- Question Reflection	Leader reflects student questions appropriately, answering only those questions posed by students that they cannot at that time reasonably answer themselves.	Leader both reflects and answers questions for students that are germane to discussion, at times thinking for the students when they need to be doing so.	Answers questions for students that they should answer themselves OR doesn't provide information requested by students that they cannot at that time reasonably answer themselves.	
Time on Topic	Leader ensures that students spend time on topic; discourages deviation from topic; appropriately deflects inappropriate lines of discussion.	Leader generally maintains control over the discussion, but from time to time allows it to deviate from goal due to inappropriate student input.	Leader allows discussion to deviate significantly or completely from stated goal.	
Pacing	Leader moves discussion along at an appropriate pace as reflected by progress toward goal and student attitudes and body language.	Leader moves discussion along at a slower pace than necessary to achieve goal as reflect by student attitudes and body language.	Leader moves discussion along at a snail's pace; students clearly bored as reflected in their attitudes and body language.	
Atmosphere	Leader maintains a friendly, collaborative atmosphere; all students appear free to participate without recrimination.	Leader tends to maintain an reasonable atmosphere for discussion, but sometimes fails to control criticisms or witticisms of others.	Leader fails to maintain atmosphere conducive to successful discussion; students are offended by witticisms of others.	
Closure	Leader helps students to arrive at a meaningful conclusion to the discussion, restating the original problem or goal, and having students explain its solution or achievement; uses appropriate questioning to ensure attainment of goal.	Leader tends to do his or her own summary; concludes discussion early and quickly due to a lack of time; does a minimal job to determine whether or not educational goal has been attained.	Leader does not achieve any form of closure, or does so very inadequately; runs out of time; does not assess to determine whether or not students have achieved educational goal.	
Copyright 2006 *Physics Teacher Education Program* *Illinois State University*			**TOTAL:**	

Comments: